



Campus Safety FAQs

What was the nature of the confrontation in the Milstein Center on April 11, 2019?

On April 11, 2019, a black man later identified as a Columbia University student was involved in a confrontation with Barnard College Public Safety ("BCPS") personnel. The student had walked past a BCPS officer assigned to the main gate of Barnard College without showing identification. Barnard College has a [policy](#) that all individuals who enter the campus after 11:00 p.m. are required to display identification to the BCPS officer at the main gate. The officer radioed for assistance as he followed the student to the Milstein Center for Teaching and Learning ("Milstein Center"). Inside the Milstein Center, the officer approached the student and requested identification, and a physical altercation ensued.

Who investigated the confrontation in the Milstein Center on April 11, 2019?

T&M Protection Resources is a New York City-based private security and investigative firm. The firm has investigated a variety of incidents on college campuses across New York state and the country. The investigation was conducted by a team that included four investigators who met with Barnard Public Safety officers and students.

What was investigated?

T&M was asked to investigate the April 11 incident in the Milstein Center to conduct an independent analysis of the confrontation, to determine if race was a factor in the response by BCPS toward the Columbia University student, and to make appropriate recommendations as necessary and consistent with best practices. In addition, investigators were asked to conduct a review of the College's policies, procedures, and training relating to Public Safety. Please click [here](#) to review the complete report.

Who participated in the investigation?

To obtain information about the confrontation itself and to get a sense of the community's experiences with Public Safety, T&M conducted 30 interviews with members of the Barnard community — including students; Public Safety officers, supervisors and leadership; and Aramark employees who were present at the Milstein Center that night — and reviewed all internal and external video. The Columbia student who was involved in the altercation declined to be interviewed.

What did the investigation reveal?

The investigators did not find sufficient evidence to determine there was racial bias in this specific incident. However, they did report on community perceptions of racial bias and flawed policies and training that could create the conditions for bias.

The investigation found that "the breadth of the response and the lack of utilization of de-escalation techniques served to intensify the encounter for both the Columbia student and for the Barnard students present in the Milstein Center and was inconsistent with best practices for a campus security department."

The investigation also found that deficiencies in written guidelines, policies, and training for how to interact with the Barnard community creates an environment “in which each officer . . . responds or reacts dissimilarly” to events on campus, creating a “perception of disparate treatment of individuals with whom [Public Safety] interacts on campus.”

What recommendations did the investigators make to the College?

The investigators made several recommendations, including:

- Formalize a training program for new officers to complement state-mandated training, including specific training by Barnard management on policies, procedures, and management expectations;
- Undertake an ongoing, comprehensive, formalized training program for all officers to reflect best practices consistent with the mission of the College and to specifically include de-escalation training;
- Conduct an independent and comprehensive physical security assessment of the Barnard campus; and
- Create a process to ensure compliance with all policies and procedures.

Why were the officers who were being investigated placed on paid leave?

It is the College’s practice to place employees involved in a pending investigation on paid administrative leave.

What has the College done in response to the results of the investigation?

The College disciplined those officers who were directly involved in the confrontation as warranted by their individual conduct. Both the supervisor involved in the confrontation and the Executive Director of Public Safety are no longer employed by the College.

Amy Zavadil will serve as the interim Executive Director for Public Safety while the College searches for a permanent Executive Director. Zavadil holds a Ph.D. in Counselor Education and Supervision and most recently served as the University of Dayton’s Equity Compliance Officer. She knows the Barnard community well, having served as Associate Dean for Equity from 2011 to 2017. As Interim Executive Director, Zavadil will focus on implementing the recommendations made by the independent investigator, enhancing training for all Public Safety officers, and ensuring that the College’s policies and procedures are clear and accessible to the community.

Is College leadership satisfied that the investigation answered the important questions at hand?

The external independent investigation was necessary to understand Barnard Public Safety’s practices, policies, and procedures in the context of best practices nationally. As such, the investigation report will lead to meaningful improvements in Public Safety leadership, policies, and training. However, it is important to note that the investigators did not have sufficient evidence to fully answer the question about whether racial or other forms of bias are present in Public Safety’s ongoing interactions with the community. The investigation is just one piece of Barnard’s broader efforts to improve community safety and campus climate. [The Community Safety Group](#) will play an essential role in this important and ongoing work.

Why was the Community Safety Group formed?

Following a confrontation between a self-identified black Columbia student and Barnard Public Safety officers on April 11, 2019, President Beilock created the Community Safety Group to ensure an ongoing

and productive dialogue between members of the Barnard community and the Department of Public Safety in which honest feedback and experiences could be shared, policies and procedures could be reviewed, and solutions for systemic change could be incubated. The Community Safety Group works in an advisory capacity to President Beilock, providing recommendations directly to her.

The Community Safety Group held two meetings at the end of the spring semester and will meet again in September when all members return to campus. As part of this work, they will seek more campus input on our community's experiences with Public Safety and perceptions of bias.

How was the Group composed?

The [Community Safety Group](#) is being co-chaired by Molree Williams-Lendor, the Executive Director of Equity, and Ariana González Stokas, the Vice President for [Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion](#). The group also consists of students, faculty, staff, and members of the Department of Public Safety. Some volunteered for the group, and others were asked to participate.

Why is there representation from the Department of Public Safety in the Group?

It is important to have representatives from the Department of Public Safety because structural change — the change that includes policies, practices, and procedures — cannot happen without their active participation. In addition to being able to hear regularly and constructively from community members about how the work of Public Safety is perceived and experienced on campus, the Public Safety representatives can share their perspectives so that the Group's work can be built on a more comprehensive knowledge base.

How can I participate in the group's work?

Please email CommunitySafetyGroup@barnard.edu, and your name will be added to a roster of volunteers to whom the Group will reach out when it needs to hear from additional voices and perspectives. You are also welcome to submit your thoughts and feedback, as well as share resources, either via email or via this [form](#), which accepts anonymous submissions.

How does this relate to the Council on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion?

The Barnard Community Safety Group focuses on issues of diversity, equity, and inclusion as they pertain to how safety and security are considered, constructed, and implemented on Barnard's campus, while the [Council on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion](#) (CDEI) has a broader purview. The work of the CDEI and the Community Safety Group complement and reinforce each other, and there will be jointly sponsored programs and initiatives related to community safety over the 2019-2020 academic year. The respective groups will, as part of the work of the fall semester, recommend permanent structures for Public Safety community oversight and where those structures will be located.

What is Barnard doing to improve campus climate and ensure that all individuals feel welcome, respected, and safe?

This summer, after a yearlong search, Barnard hired [Ariana González Stokas](#), the College's first-ever Vice President for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion. Recognizing that our students, staff, and faculty come from diverse backgrounds, we understand that the work of inclusion is ongoing and that we must all strive to transform institutional systems and structures. In an effort to better understand the specific areas we need to focus on, the College will conduct a variety of campus climate surveys. Barnard champions inclusiveness and is committed to fostering a safe, respectful, and welcoming environment that upholds its nondiscrimination policy, both through its policies and daily treatment of one another. Barnard's

Council on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion will continue the work of inclusion across College units throughout the upcoming year. The Council will focus on collaborations to ensure that the work of improving campus climate is collective and informed by the diversity of the Barnard community.

What is the mission of Barnard's Public Safety Department?

[Barnard College Public Safety](#) is committed to providing a safe and secure environment conducive to education. The safety and well-being of students, faculty, staff, and guests is of paramount importance at Barnard College. Located in Morningside Heights in Manhattan, Barnard is a community within its larger, neighboring communities: Columbia University and New York City. Separate from them in some ways, the College of course has many mutual interests with Columbia and NYC, including crime prevention, first aid, and fire safety.

How safe is Barnard's campus?

In their report, the investigators state that their "data driven analysis revealed that [Barnard College Public Safety officers] have assisted in making the Barnard campus an overwhelmingly safe campus."

Beyond security-related activities, what else is Public Safety tasked to do?

Public Safety operates 24/7 and performs a variety of services, including:

- Assisting members of the community with accessibility needs;
- Providing transportation services, including shuttle services and transport to/from medical providers;
- Managing access to campus buildings, including electronic access control; and
- Responding to medical issues, including providing aid to community members in distress.

Public Safety is also responsible for fire and life safety activities related to fire alarm systems, response to fire alarms, planning and preparing for fire drills, elevator incidents, and other similar activities.

What is the Barnard Public Safety policy about physically touching individuals?

Barnard follows state guidelines related to use of force that are applicable to Public Safety's status as a regulated security department for a private institution. Within these guidelines, Public Safety is trained to use force only in the event that someone is a danger to themselves or others.

What kind of training does Barnard Public Safety staff currently undergo?

Public Safety staff, including supervisors, undergo annual mandatory New York State Security Guard Training, which is required for the NYS Security Guard License that all staff must have. This training is conducted by the Director of Emergency Management and Fire Safety, who is state certified.

"The Analysis of Confrontation Between Barnard College Public Safety and A Columbia University Student on April 11, 2019," prepared by T&M Protection Resources, LLC, recommends that training for all Public Safety officers be enhanced and made more comprehensive, including specific training on de-escalation techniques. It also recommends that the policies, procedures, and guidelines of the department be updated. As a starting point, during the summer, Public Safety officers and supervisors received training on the topics of de-escalation and working across differences.

What is the relationship between Barnard and Columbia's Public Safety Departments?

The Barnard Public Safety Department is separate from and independent of the Columbia University Public Safety Department. While the departments share information as needed, each has its separate

policies, procedures, and training. The jurisdiction of Barnard's Public Safety is limited to Barnard property. Situations that involve Barnard students but happen on Columbia's campus are under the jurisdiction of Columbia's Public Safety Department and are subject to that department's policies, practices, and procedures, as well as those of Columbia University.

What does it mean that the Barnard Public Safety staff do not have "law enforcement status"?

Barnard Public Safety is not a law enforcement agency, but rather a department within a private institution committed to the safety and security of the Barnard community. Public Safety has limited powers of arrest (citizen's arrest) as defined by NYS Criminal Procedure Law. By contrast, the New York City Police Department is sworn to uphold the law and are mandated to carry out the specific powers and responsibilities granted to them under the NYS Criminal Procedure Law. They have extensive statewide arrest powers as defined by the NYS Criminal Procedure Law.

Are Barnard Public Safety officers required to have a law enforcement background?

No. Prior experience with NYPD or law enforcement is not a requirement for employment with Barnard College Public Safety. Some of Barnard's Public Safety staff do have prior NYPD experience, across all levels of the organization. These individuals comprise approximately 15% of the total department.

When is the NYPD called to Barnard's campus?

Public Safety calls the NYPD to campus for any event that brings the New York Fire Department and/or EMS medical technicians to campus. The NYPD also provides assistance in traffic/crowd management near campus for Commencement and other large events. Additionally, Public Safety will call the NYPD when assistance is needed in a criminal matter. Private citizens, including faculty, staff, students, and contractors/employees of Barnard's vendors (for example, employees of Barnard's dining services provider), have the right to call the NYPD and/or other emergency services through 911.

Is the NYPD involved in the training of Barnard Public Safety?

The NYPD has assisted in training Public Safety supervisors and other Barnard staff members for emergency preparedness and citywide emergency planning. Additionally, the NYPD has been invited to Barnard to train students on crime prevention, scams, and safety in NYC.

How does Public Safety get feedback from different constituents?

Public Safety welcomes comments and feedback from the Barnard community. During the academic year, Public Safety will conduct listening sessions for faculty and staff, speak with the Student Government Association, and engage with the Barnard Staff Advisory Council. Any member of the community can email comments or concerns to publicsafety@barnard.edu or fill out this [form](#), available on the Public Safety main page, which allows for anonymous feedback.

Where do I go with questions, concerns, and/or complaints?

[Office of Equity](#)
[Human Resources](#)

What are general resources for students?

[Furman Counseling](#) - confidential
[Ombuds Office](#) - confidential
[Barnard Primary Care Health Service](#) - confidential
[Well Woman](#) - not confidential

[Sexual Violence Resources](#) (for example, for sexual harassment complaints) - confidential
[Dean of Studies Office](#) - not confidential

What are general resources for faculty and staff?

Barnard's Human Resources Office provides an [Employee Assistance Program](#) that offers short-term counseling to help faculty and members of their household manage everyday life issues.

What should I do if I'm not sure if I should report what I've seen or experienced?

The [Office of Equity](#) advises people to discuss the information with a confidential source to determine next steps.